



# DISARMAMENT: TWO APPROACHES

**A Comparison**

**U.S. and U.S.S.R. Disarmament Proposals**

**UNITED STATES ARMS CONTROL AND DISARMAMENT AGENCY**

## CONTENTS

	Page
Introduction.....	1
Disarmament Goals .....	5
Governing Principles .....	6
International Disarmament Organization.....	8
Peaceful Settlement of Disputes .....	10
Conventional Armed Forces and Armaments .....	13
Nuclear Weapons.....	15
Strategic Nuclear Weapons Delivery Vehicles.....	18
Chemical, Biological, and Radiological Weapons .....	20
Military Bases and Facilities .....	21
Outer Space.....	22
Protection Against Accident, Miscalculation, and Surprise Attack .....	23

UNITED STATES ARMS CONTROL AND DISARMAMENT AGENCY  
PUBLICATION 1

General Series 1

Released November 1961

For sale by the Superintendent of Documents, U.S. Government Printing Office  
Washington 25, D.C. Price 15 cents

## INTRODUCTION

Almost overnight a few nations have acquired the awesome power to destroy all mankind. In a world divided ideologically and filled with mistrust, this power is an ever-present threat to our civilization and to every human on earth. It must be brought under control. At the same time, since disputes among nations will continue, alternatives to war must be found to settle them. Disarmament and the development of adequate international peacekeeping arrangements are therefore of equal importance in man's effort to attain freedom from war, without which other freedoms cannot long endure.

In September 1961 the United States submitted to the United Nations General Assembly a new program for general and complete disarmament and for the simultaneous strengthening of international peacekeeping machinery.

In September 1960 the U.S.S.R. introduced in the United Nations General Assembly a document containing its basic proposals for a treaty on general and complete disarmament. Since then it has issued other papers explaining those proposals.

The purpose of this pamphlet is to make possible a convenient comparison of these disarmament proposals of the United States and the U.S.S.R. and to facilitate a better understanding of the complicated issues involved in reaching the goal of general and complete disarmament in a peaceful world. In the interests of simplification and brevity, detailed provisions of the U.S. and Soviet plans have been condensed, paraphrased, and presented in outline form. The reader is cautioned to bear in mind that, while these outlines are considered accurate, they are not the official texts of the programs of either Government.

A list of the documents used in the preparation of this pamphlet will be found inside the back cover. The text of the U.S. program is available in a Department

of State publication entitled Freedom From War, which also contains a summary of the program (D.S. pub. 7277).

After a series of bilateral talks during the summer of 1961, the United States and U.S.S.R. agreed to recommend to the United Nations General Assembly a Joint Statement of Agreed Principles as a guide for future multilateral negotiations on disarmament. This statement includes certain general principles on which the two countries were able to agree and, for that reason, represents a step forward. However, a study of the comparison of the two plans set forth in this pamphlet will reveal fundamental differences on how those principles should be applied to disarmament measures. The most basic areas of such disagreement are as follows:

### **Immediate Disarmament Action**

United States. The United States calls on all states to make a continuous, uninterrupted effort to achieve a total program for general and complete disarmament. However, it rejects the "all or nothing" approach. It seeks the widest possible area of agreement at the earliest date without waiting for agreement on the entire program. The United States also believes that a number of significant initial measures could be put into effect at a very early date and does not believe that action on them should be unnecessarily delayed.

U.S.S.R. Although it has put forward certain proposals apart from its disarmament plan to ease international tensions and create a favorable climate for disarmament, the U.S.S.R. takes the position, insofar as disarmament measures are concerned, that there must be full agreement on all aspects of general and complete disarmament before implementing a single measure. Because of the complexity of the problem, it might take years before all phases

of a complete program could be agreed upon and put into effect. Meanwhile the arms race would continue and the peril to humanity would increase unnecessarily.

### Peacekeeping Machinery

United States. Whether or not there is general and complete disarmament, the United States assumes that disputes between nations will continue and recognizes that without some workable system of resolving such disputes peacefully individual nations will be reluctant to relinquish their armed forces. The United States, therefore, calls for the progressive strengthening of international institutions under the United Nations as disarmament proceeds and for the creation of a United Nations Peace Force adequate to enforce the peace.

U.S.S.R. The U.S.S.R. plan does not provide for the improvement of means of settling disputes and preserving the peace as nations disarm. Its proposals for certain measures under the U.N. Charter and for making contingents of national police available to the United Nations apply only after general and complete disarmament has been achieved.

### Effective Disarmament Controls

United States. A key element in any disarmament program is agreement on the levels of forces and armaments each nation would be permitted to retain at each stage of the disarmament process. The United States insists that the control organization have the necessary powers of inspection and verification to be able to certify that states have lived up to their obligations in this respect. The United States has made clear to the Soviet Union that this principle of

verification of agreed levels of retained armed forces and armaments is a necessary element in any comprehensive disarmament negotiation or agreement.

U.S.S.R. The U.S.S.R., however, refuses to permit verification of levels of armed forces or armaments retained at each stage of the disarmament process. Thus, in effect, states would have no way of being certain that other parties were observing their most basic commitments under the agreement.

### Administration of the International Disarmament Organization

United States. For the surveillance and enforcement of disarmament agreements, the United States proposes that the control organization be operated on a day-to-day basis by an Administrator, subject to policies established by a Commission of several states, with the authority and international staff to assure impartial and effective administration.

U.S.S.R. The U.S.S.R. insists that this executive authority be exercised by a multinational council with representatives of Communist, "neutralist," and "Western" states and with decisions on all matters of substance to be made by a two-thirds majority. To substitute a council of this type for an independent executive would inject conflicting national interests into the day-to-day operation of the control organization and render it most ineffective in supervising the disarmament program.

## DISARMAMENT GOALS

### United States

A free world under the rule of law with procedures for the peaceful settlement of disputes

A free, secure, and peaceful world of independent states adhering to common standards of justice and international conduct and subjecting the use of force to the rule of law.

A world where adjustment to change takes place in accordance with the principles of the United Nations.

General and complete disarmament

A world where there shall be a permanent state of general and complete disarmament under effective international control.

Use of resources

A world where the resources of nations shall be devoted to man's material, cultural, and spiritual advance.

### U.S.S.R.

No provision.

After general and complete disarmament has been achieved, measures to be put into effect for preserving peace and security in accordance with the United Nations Charter.

General and complete disarmament under strict and effective international controls. (Note: In elaborating on this goal, the Soviets reject control of agreed levels of armaments at any stage except after general and complete disarmament has been obtained.)

Part of funds released from expenditure on armaments to be used for economic assistance to underdeveloped countries.

## GOVERNING PRINCIPLES

### United States

Task of negotiating states

A continuous, uninterrupted effort to achieve agreement on a total program for general and complete disarmament.

To seek the widest possible area of agreement at the earliest date and implement specific measures as soon as possible without waiting for agreement on the total program.

International peacekeeping capabilities

As states relinquish their arms, the United Nations to be progressively strengthened in order to improve its capacity to assure international security, the peaceful settlement of disputes, and the development of international cooperation in common tasks for the benefit of mankind.

Disarmament stages

Disarmament to take place as rapidly as possible until it is completed, in stages containing balanced, phased, and safeguarded measures in a manner that will not affect adversely the security of any state.

Each measure and stage to be carried out in an agreed period of time.

### U.S.S.R.

Agreement to be reached on a single treaty for all stages of general and complete disarmament.

No specific disarmament measures to be implemented until total agreement on all measures has been reached.

After general and complete disarmament has been achieved, measures to be put into effect for preserving peace and security in accordance with the United Nations Charter.

General and complete disarmament to be achieved in three successive stages with no state to gain a military advantage at any stage.

Fixed time limits to be set in advance, not only for each stage but also for the entire disarmament process.

## GOVERNING PRINCIPLES (Continued)

### United States

Transition to  
next stage

Transition from one stage to the next to take place after all measures in the preceding stage have been carried out and verified and after necessary arrangements have been instituted for the next stage.

Inspection  
and  
verification

Verification to establish that agreed limitations or reductions take place.  
Verification to establish that retained forces and armaments do not exceed agreed levels at any stage.

### U. S. S. R.

(Note: The Soviet proposals are not clear on this point. On the one hand, they require that a definite time limit be set in advance for the entire disarmament program and provide only for reports on progress being made. On the other hand, in explaining their proposals, they imply that transition to the next stage will take place "after the control organization and Security Council have satisfied themselves that all states have fulfilled their obligations.")

Control and inspection limited to reductions taking place.

No verification of agreed levels of forces and armaments to be retained except with respect to national police forces remaining after general and complete disarmament.

## INTERNATIONAL DISARMAMENT ORGANIZATION

### United States

Form of  
organization

An International Disarmament Organization to be established within the framework of the United Nations with the following form of organization:

- A General Conference of all states party to the agreement.
- A Commission, with representatives of major powers, plus certain other states on a rotating basis, to establish general policy.
- An Administrator, subject to the direction of the Commission, with the authority, international staff, and finances adequate to assure effective and impartial administration of the Organization.

Expansion  
of  
functions

The Organization's functions to be expanded progressively as required for the effective verification of the disarmament program.

### U.S.S.R.

A control organization to be set up within the framework of the United Nations:

- All parties to the treaty to meet periodically at a conference.
- A control council with representatives of Communist, "neutralist," and "Western" states acting on substantive matters by a two-thirds majority.
- The control council to be responsible for the practical administration of the control system.

The control organization to have at each stage powers in conformity with the scope and nature of the disarmament measures involved.

## INTERNATIONAL DISARMAMENT ORGANIZATION (Continued)

### United States

Principal  
duties

The International Disarmament Organization to certify to all states that agreed reductions have taken place and that retained forces and armaments do not exceed permitted levels. Also to determine the transition from one stage to the next.

### U. S. S. R.

The control council to be responsible for the practical administration of the control system, to draw up instructions, and to analyze and process reports rendered to it.

## PEACEFUL SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES

	United States	U. S. S. R.
	<u>First Stage</u>	<u>First Stage</u>
Renunciation of use of armed force	States to reaffirm their obligations under the U.N. Charter to refrain from the threat or use of any type of armed force contrary to the principles of the U.N. Charter.	No provision.
Renunciation of indirect aggression and subversion	States to agree to refrain from indirect aggression and subversion against any country.	No provision.
Peace observation group	Creation of a U.N. peace observation group to be staffed with a standing cadre of observers who could be dispatched to investigate any situation which might constitute a threat to or breach of the peace.	No provision.
Peacekeeping arrangements under the United Nations	States to use all appropriate processes for the peaceful settlement of disputes and to seek within the United Nations further arrangements for the peaceful settlement of international disputes and for the codification and progressive development of international law.	No provision.

## PEACEFUL SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES (Continued)

### United States

#### First Stage

United Nations  
Peace Force

States to develop arrangements for the establishment in the second stage of a United Nations Peace Force.

#### Second Stage

Peacekeeping  
arrangements  
under the  
United Nations

The structure, authority, and operation of the United Nations to be strengthened in order that the United Nations will be able effectively to protect states against threats to or breaches of the peace.

United Nations  
Peace Force

A permanent international peace force to be established within the United Nations and progressively strengthened so that during the third stage it shall be able effectively to deter or suppress any threat or use of force in violation of the purposes and principles of the United Nations.

### U.S.S.R.

#### First Stage

No provision.

#### Second Stage

Studies to be undertaken of measures to be implemented in the third stage to maintain peace and security in accordance with the United Nations Charter under conditions of general and complete disarmament.

No provision.

## PEACEFUL SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES (Continued)

### United States

### U. S. S. R.

#### Third Stage

Peacekeeping  
arrangements  
under the  
United Nations

All international disputes to be settled under the strengthened United Nations in accordance with agreed principles of international conduct.

United Nations  
Peace Force

No state to have the military power to challenge the progressively strengthened United Nations Peace Force.

#### Third Stage

After general and complete disarmament, measures for preserving peace and security in accordance with the U.N. Charter to be put into effect.

After general and complete disarmament, states to undertake, where necessary, to place at the disposal of the Security Council units from contingents of national police remaining at their disposal.

## CONVENTIONAL ARMED FORCES AND ARMAMENTS

### United States

#### First Stage

Force levels

Force levels to be limited to 2.1 million each for the United States and U.S.S.R. and to appropriate levels not exceeding 2.1 for all other militarily significant states. Reductions to proceed by equitable, proportionate, and verified steps.

Armaments levels

Armaments of prescribed types to be reduced by equitable and balanced steps and to be transferred to international depots for destruction or transfer to peaceful uses.

Production of armaments

Production of agreed types of armaments to be limited.

### U. S. S. R.

#### First Stage

Forces of all states to be reduced to fixed levels, with the United States and U.S.S.R. reduced to 1.7 million men.

Conventional weapons and munitions released by reduction in force levels to be destroyed. Military equipment to be destroyed or used for peaceful purposes.

No provision except for reduction of military expenditures and the discontinuance of production of all means of delivering nuclear weapons.

## CONVENTIONAL ARMED FORCES AND ARMAMENTS (Continued)

### United States

#### Second Stage

Further reductions in forces, armaments, and production

Further substantial reductions in force levels and armaments by equitable and balanced steps, with transfer of armaments to depots and further restrictions on production of armaments.

#### Third Stage

Further reductions in forces, armaments, and production

Armed forces, armaments, and production of armaments to be reduced to lowest levels required to maintain internal order and to provide contributions to U.N. Peace Force.

Military establishments

No provision.

### U. S. S. R.

#### Second Stage

Armed forces and armaments to be further reduced to agreed levels.

#### Third Stage

Armed forces, armaments, and production of armaments to be abolished except for light firearms required by strictly limited police forces in each country.

War ministries, general staffs, reserve training, and military service of all kinds to be abolished.

## NUCLEAR WEAPONS

### United States

#### First Stage

Testing of  
nuclear weapons

States that have not acceded to a treaty effectively prohibiting the testing of nuclear weapons to do so.

Nuclear weapons  
stockpiles

A Nuclear Experts Commission to examine the feasibility and means for accomplishing the verified reduction and eventual elimination of nuclear weapons stockpiles.

Production of  
fissionable  
materials

The production of fissionable materials for use in weapons to be stopped.

Transfer of  
fissionable  
materials to  
nonweapons  
purposes

After production of fissionable materials for use in weapons has ceased, agreed initial quantities of fissionable materials from past production to be transferred to nonweapons purposes.

### U. S. S. R.

#### First Stage

No provision.

Studies to be made of second stage measures for the reduction of stockpiles of nuclear weapons.

Joint studies of measures to be undertaken in second stage for discontinuance of manufacture of nuclear weapons.

No provision.

## NUCLEAR WEAPONS (Continued)

### United States

#### First Stage

Proliferation of  
nuclear weapons

States owning nuclear weapons would not relinquish control of such weapons to any nation not owning them and would not transmit to any such nation information or material necessary for their manufacture. States not owning nuclear weapons would not manufacture or attempt to obtain control of such weapons from other states.

Fissionable materials transferred between countries for peaceful uses to be subject to safeguards developed in agreement with the International Atomic Energy Agency.

#### Second Stage

Nuclear weapons  
stockpiles

Stocks of nuclear weapons to be reduced to agreed levels on the basis of findings of Nuclear Experts Commission, with excess of fissionable materials to be transferred to peaceful purposes.

### U. S. S. R.

#### First Stage

States to undertake not to transfer weapons or technology to states not possessing them. States not possessing nuclear weapons to refrain from manufacturing them.

No provision.

#### Second Stage

Complete prohibition of nuclear weapons, with cessation of manufacture and destruction of all stockpiles of such weapons.

NUCLEAR WEAPONS (Continued)

United States

Third Stage

No national forces to be equipped with nuclear weapons.

U. S. S. R.

Third Stage

No similar explicit provision, except that states would have at their disposal only light firearms for use in maintaining internal order.

## STRATEGIC NUCLEAR WEAPONS DELIVERY VEHICLES

### United States

#### First Stage

The following measures to be implemented with respect to specified categories of strategic nuclear weapons delivery vehicles and agreed types of weapons designed to counter such vehicles:

- They are to be reduced to agreed levels by equitable and balanced steps.
- Their reduction to be accomplished by transfers to supervised depots for destruction or conversion to peaceful uses.
- Their production to be discontinued or limited.
- Their testing to be limited or halted.

#### Second Stage

Further reductions in the stocks of strategic nuclear weapons delivery vehicles and agreed types of weapons designed to counter such vehicles.

### U. S. S. R.

#### First Stage

All means of delivering nuclear weapons to be eliminated from armed forces and destroyed, and their manufacture to be discontinued.

(From the very beginning of the first stage and until the final destruction of all means of delivering nuclear weapons, the placing into orbit or stationing in outer space of any special devices, the leaving of their territorial waters by warships, and the flying beyond the limits of their national territory by military aircraft capable of carrying weapons of mass destruction will be prohibited.)

#### Second Stage

(All means for delivering nuclear weapons eliminated in first stage.)

STRATEGIC NUCLEAR WEAPONS DELIVERY VEHICLES (Continued)

United States

Third Stage

No national forces to be equipped with strategic nuclear weapons delivery vehicles or weapons to counter such vehicles.

U. S. S. R.

Third Stage

(All means for delivering nuclear weapons eliminated in first stage.)

## CHEMICAL, BIOLOGICAL, AND RADIOLOGICAL WEAPONS

### United States

#### First Stage

CBR Experts  
Commission

A Chemical, Biological, Radiological (CBR) Experts Commission to study the feasibility and means for accomplishing verifiable reduction and eventual elimination of CBR weapons stockpiles and halting of their production.

#### Second Stage

Elimination of  
CBR weapons

In accordance with the findings of the CBR Experts Commission, production to be halted, existing stocks to be progressively reduced, and resulting excess quantities to be destroyed or converted to peaceful uses.

### U. S. S. R.

#### First Stage

Joint studies of measures to be implemented in second stage for the discontinuance of manufacture of CBR weapons and the destruction of stockpiles of such weapons.

#### Second Stage

Complete prohibition of such weapons with cessation of manufacture and the destruction of stockpiles.

## MILITARY BASES AND FACILITIES

### United States

#### First Stage

No provision.

#### Second Stage

Agreed military bases and facilities, wherever located, to be dismantled or converted to peaceful uses.

### U. S. S. R.

#### First Stage

Foreign military bases and depots of all kinds to be eliminated. (No provision for national bases.)

#### Second Stage

No provision.

## OUTER SPACE

### United States

#### First Stage

Notice of  
launching of  
space vehicles

States to give advance notification of launchings of space vehicles and missiles, together with the track of the vehicle.

Stationing in  
outer space of  
mass destruction  
weapons

The placing into orbit or stationing in outer space of weapons capable of mass destruction to be prohibited.

### U. S. S. R.

#### First Stage

The launching of rockets to be exclusively for peaceful, scientific purposes and in accordance with mutually agreed criteria; also launchings to be accompanied by verification, including inspection at rocket sites.

The placing into orbit or stationing in outer space of any special devices to be prohibited until the final destruction of all means of delivering nuclear weapons.

# PROTECTION AGAINST ACCIDENT, MISCALCULATION, AND SURPRISE ATTACK

## United States

## U. S. S. R.

### First Stage

### First Stage

Notification  
of military  
movements

States to give advance notification of major military movements and maneuvers which might cause alarm and induce countermeasures.

No provision.

Observation  
posts

Observation posts to be established at major ports, railway centers, highways, and air bases to report on concentrations and movements of military forces.

No provision.

Additional  
measures

An international commission to be established to recommend further measures to reduce the risk of nuclear war by accident, miscalculation, or failure of communications.

No provision.

Additional inspection arrangements to be established to reduce the danger of surprise attack.

No provision.

The following U.N. General Assembly documents were used in the preparation of this pamphlet:

Basic Provisions of a Treaty on General and Complete Disarmament, introduced on September 23, 1960, by the U.S.S.R. for consideration of the General Assembly (A/4505).

Declaration on Disarmament: A Program for General and Complete Disarmament in a Peaceful World, submitted by the United States on September 25, 1961, for consideration by the U.N. General Assembly as a guide for disarmament negotiations (A/4891; also available in Department of State Bulletin of October 16, 1961, p. 650).

Joint Statement of Agreed Principles for Disarmament Negotiations, issued by the United States and the U.S.S.R. at conclusion of bilateral talks in September 1961 (A/4879; Department of State Bulletin of October 9, 1961, p. 589).

Letter from John J. McCloy to V. A. Zorin at conclusion of bilateral talks, reserving U.S. position on necessity for verification of retained arms and armaments (A/4880; Department of State Bulletin of October 9, 1961, p. 595).

Statement by the U.S.S.R. Government on the Bilateral U.S.S.R.-United States Disarmament Negotiations, with attached papers, handed to the U.S. delegation during the course of the talks (A/4887).

Memorandum of the U.S.S.R. on Measures to Ease International Tension, Strengthen Confidence Among States, and Contribute to General and Complete Disarmament, September 26, 1961 (A/4892).

